

# **GST Distribution Review Final Report**

October 2012

© Commonwealth of Australia 2012

ISBN 978-0-642-74860-7

This publication is available for your use under a Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Australia licence, with the exceptions of the Commonwealth Coat of Arms; the Treasury logo; photographs; images; signatures; text quoted from State or Territory Governments, the Indigenous Expenditure Report or submissions made during the public consultation process; text from academic papers either quoted or summarised in chapter one; data, statistics or projections from State or Territory Governments, KPMG, R. Inman, J. Hines, R. Thaler, W. Watson, L. Wilson, D. Albouy, P. Dixon, M. Picton, M. Rimmer, C. Murphy, OECD, indexmundi or the Indigenous Expenditure Report; and where otherwise stated. The full licence terms are available from <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/au/legalcode>.



Use of GST Distribution Review material under a Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Australia licence requires you to attribute the work (but not in any way that suggests that the GST Distribution Review endorses you or your use of the work).

*GST Distribution Review material used 'as supplied'.*

Provided you have not modified or transformed GST Distribution Review material in any way including, for example, by changing the GST Distribution Review text; calculating percentage changes; graphing or charting data; or deriving new statistics from published GST Distribution Review statistics — then GST Distribution Review prefers the following attribution:

*Source: The Australian Government, GST Distribution Review*

Derivative material

If you have modified or transformed GST Distribution Review material, or derived new material from those of the GST Distribution Review in any way, then the GST Distribution Review prefers the following attribution:

*Based on The Australian Government, GST Distribution Review data*

### **Use of the Coat of Arms**

The terms under which the Coat of Arms can be used are set out on the It's an Honour website (see [www.itsanhonour.gov.au](http://www.itsanhonour.gov.au)).

### **Other Uses**

Inquiries regarding this licence and any other use of this document are welcome at:

Manager  
Communications  
The Treasury  
Langton Crescent Parkes ACT 2600  
Email: [medialiaison@treasury.gov.au](mailto:medialiaison@treasury.gov.au)

# Table of Contents

<b>Foreword from the Panel .....</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>Executive Summary .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1      <b>What is HFE? — A review of the literature.....</b></b>	<b>23</b>
1.1    The essence of the debate .....	23
1.2    Early discussions.....	23
1.3    The basic case for equalisation .....	25
1.4    Further work on equity.....	26
1.5    Further work on efficiency.....	29
1.6    Modelling .....	32
1.7    What conclusions can be drawn from the literature?.....	34
<b>2      <b>The contrast between models of equalisation.....</b></b>	<b>35</b>
2.1    The challenge for the Panel.....	35
2.2    The joint submission of the four largest States .....	37
2.3    Issues beyond HFE .....	38
2.4    A simple illustration of the modern equalisation system.....	39
2.5    Support and criticisms of HFE .....	41
2.6    The search for a model for Australia’s future .....	43
2.7    The Panel’s findings on the ‘right’ model of equalisation.....	44
<b>3      <b>Examining alternative equalisation approaches .....</b></b>	<b>47</b>
3.1    Proposals to do ‘less’ equalisation .....	47
3.2    Proposals for ‘less precise’ or ‘more general’ equalisation.....	56
3.3    ‘Comparable’ or ‘materially-the-same’ capacity?.....	61
<b>4      <b>Improving HFE system governance .....</b></b>	<b>63</b>
4.1    Current governance arrangements .....	64
4.2    Endorsing and promulgating the definition of HFE .....	64
4.3    Reviewing the CGC Act.....	66
4.4    Reviewing the CGC’s implementation of HFE.....	67
4.5    Setting priorities for future methodology reviews .....	68
4.6    Providing further guidelines for the Treasurer and CGC .....	69
<b>5      <b>Improving communication and transparency.....</b></b>	<b>75</b>
5.1    Clarifying the presentation of relativities .....	75
5.2    Clarifying or improving the projection of relativities .....	78
5.3    Broadening the engagement of the CGC.....	82
5.4    Improving the interaction between HFE and Payments for Specific Purposes (PSPs).....	83
<b>6      <b>Greater stability of GST shares and methodology improvements.....</b></b>	<b>89</b>
6.1    The treatment of Commonwealth capital payments .....	89
6.2    Data revisions.....	94
6.3    A simplified and integrated assessment framework .....	97
6.4    Cost equalisation .....	100

<b>7</b>	<b>Assessing mining revenue and expenditure</b> .....	<b>105</b>
7.1	Should mining be treated differently to other revenue? .....	105
7.2	Changes to the mining revenue assessment .....	109
7.3	Are all mining related expenditure needs recognised?.....	113
<b>8</b>	<b>State mining royalties and the MRRT</b> .....	<b>121</b>
8.1	State royalties and the Commonwealth’s resource taxes.....	121
8.2	A cooperative approach remains the best solution.....	124
8.3	Fixing the interaction between MRRT and State royalties.....	128
8.4	What form should an agreement take? .....	130
<b>9</b>	<b>Efficiency and tax reform</b> .....	<b>135</b>
9.1	Relationship between HFE and efficiency.....	136
9.2	Tax reform .....	140
<b>10</b>	<b>The role of HFE in Indigenous service provision</b> .....	<b>143</b>
10.1	How much GST revenue does <i>Indigeneity</i> redistribute? .....	143
10.2	Drivers of GST redistribution due to <i>Indigeneity</i> .....	144
10.3	What the Panel found .....	146
10.4	Other <i>Indigeneity</i> related issues .....	148
<b>11</b>	<b>Ensuring the GST pool is robust and stable</b> .....	<b>151</b>
11.1	What is the GST pool designed to achieve? .....	151
11.2	How well has the GST pool performed? .....	153
11.3	Making the GST pool more robust and stable.....	157
<b>12</b>	<b>HFE and federal finances in the longer term</b> .....	<b>165</b>
12.1	The need for a longer term vision .....	165
12.2	Emerging fiscal pressures .....	166
12.3	State tax reform.....	168
12.4	Roles and responsibilities .....	170
12.5	Commonwealth assistance to States in the longer term.....	172
	<b>Appendix A: Terms of Reference</b> .....	<b>177</b>
	<b>Appendix B: Aspects of vertical and horizontal equity in government policy action</b> .....	<b>181</b>
	<b>Appendix C: Ideas considered but not adopted</b> .....	<b>183</b>
	<b>Appendix D: Alternative mining scenarios</b> .....	<b>185</b>
	<b>Appendix E: Stabilised pool options</b> .....	<b>189</b>
	<b>Appendix F: Changes in State fiscal capacities over time</b> .....	<b>193</b>
	<b>Appendix G: OECD VAT rates</b> .....	<b>203</b>
	<b>Appendix H: Consultations</b> .....	<b>205</b>
	<b>Glossary</b> .....	<b>213</b>
	<b>Acronyms</b> .....	<b>219</b>
	<b>References</b> .....	<b>221</b>